



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
25th February 2020, at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff,  
Robert James MacRae, Esquire.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Air Chief Marshall Sir Stephen Dalton, G.C.B., LL.D. (Hon.), D.Sc. (Hon.), B.Sc., F.R.Ae.S.,  
C.C.M.I. was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Sarah Craig Ferguson – ill  
Senator John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré – excused attendance  
Senator Stephen William Pallett – ill  
Deputy Judith Ann Martin of St. Helier – absent on States business  
Deputy Carolyn Fiona Labey of Grouville – en défaut  
Deputy Louise Mary Catherine Doublet of St. Saviour – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.54 a.m.)  
Deputy Scott Michael Wickenden of St. Helier – absent on States business  
Deputy Kevin Glyn Pamplin of St. Saviour – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 2.53 p.m.)

---

Prayers read by the Deputy Greffier of the States

---

**Senator John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré – absence**

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Connétable of St. Ouen, made in accordance with Standing Order 53(3), agreed that the reason for the absence of Senator John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré was such that he should be excused attendance.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 33**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
Senator K.L. Moore  
Senator S.Y. Mézec  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)

**CONTRE: 3**

Connétable of St. Saviour  
Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

### Subordinate enactments tabled

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Money Laundering (Amendment No. 11) (Jersey) Order 2020. <i>Minister for External Relations.</i>	R&O.8/2020.
Planning and Building (Island Plan) (Amendment) (Jersey) Order 2020. <i>Minister for the Environment.</i>	R&O.9/2020.
Air Navigation (Fees) (Amendment No. 2) (Jersey) Order 2020. <i>Minister for External Relations.</i>	R&O.10/2020.
Road Traffic (Parking Places – Charges) (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Order 2020. <i>Minister for Infrastructure.</i>	R&O.11/2020.

### Documents presented

Carbon Neutral Strategy 2019 (P.127/2019): amendment (P.127/2019 Amd.) – comments. Presented: 21st February 2020. <i>Minister for the Environment.</i>	P.127/2019. Amd. Com.
Carbon Neutral Strategy 2019 (P.127/2019): amendment (P.127/2019 Amd.) – amendment (P.127/2019 Amd.Amd.) – comments. Presented: 21st February 2020. <i>Minister for the Environment.</i>	P.127/2019. Amd.Amd. Com.
Carbon Neutral Strategy 2019 (P.127/2019): second amendment (P.127/2019 Amd.(2)) – comments. Presented: 21st February 2020. <i>Minister for the Environment.</i>	P.127/2019. Amd.(2) Com.
The Communications (Jersey) Order 2020: extension to Jersey by Order in Council (P.14/2020) – addendum to report. Presented: 25th February 2020. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	P.14/2020. Add.

Non-Ministerial Departments (R.148/2019): Executive response. Presented: 17th February 2020. <i>Public Accounts Committee.</i>	R.148/2019. Res.
Andium Homes Ltd.: appointment of Non-Executive Director. Presented: 5th February 2020. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.6/2020.
Land Transactions under Standing Orders 168(3) – Fliquet Tower and Bunker, St. Martin – 25-year lease to The Families in Recovery Trust. Presented: 5th February 2020. <i>Minister for Infrastructure.</i>	R.7/2020.
Births, Deaths, Stillbirths, Marriages and Civil Partnerships registered in the twelve parishes of the Island of Jersey for the year 2019. Presented: 6th February 2020. <i>Minister for Home Affairs.</i>	R.8/2020.
Summary of Progress: responding to the Independent Jersey Care Inquiry – January 2020. Presented: 12th February 2020. <i>Minister for Children and Housing.</i>	R.9/2020.
Ministerial Responsibilities: Ministers and Assistant Ministers. Presented: 13th February 2020. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	R.10/2020.
Transfers between Heads of Expenditure under the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2005: Article 18(1)(c) and (1A) – end of year 2019. Presented: 18th February 2020. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.11/2020.
Andium Homes Ltd.: appointment of Non-Executive Directors. Presented: 20th February 2020. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.12/2020.
States of Jersey Law 2005: delegation of functions – Minister for Treasury and Resources – revised delegations February 2020. Presented: 25th February 2020. <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	R.13/2020.
Election expenditure and political donations. Presented: 25th February 2020. <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee.</i>	R.14/2020.
Minimum standards for rented dwellings: licensing regulations. Presented: 21st February 2020. <i>Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel.</i>	S.R.1/2020.
Response to the Care Inquiry: Update Report November 2019 (S.R.12/2019) – response of the Minister for Children and Housing. Presented: 7th February 2020. <i>Minister for Children and Housing.</i>	S.R.12/2019. Res.

Scrutiny Review of the Government Plan: 2020–2023 (S.R.13/2019) – Care of Children in Jersey Review Panel findings – joint response of the Ministers for Children and Housing and Home Affairs. S.R.13/2019.  
Res.(7)  
Presented: 10th February 2020.  
*Minister for Children and Housing.*

Minimum standards for rented dwellings: licensing regulations (S.R.1/2020) – response of the Minister for the Environment. S.R.1/2020.  
Res.  
Presented: 25th February 2020.  
*Minister for the Environment.*

Recurring Themes: Financial Management. P.A.C.1/2020.  
Presented: 17th February 2020.  
*Public Accounts Committee.*

### Notification of lodged propositions

Draft Public Health and Safety (Rented Dwellings) (Licensing) (Jersey) Regulations 201- (P.106/2019): second amendment. P.106/2019.  
Amd.(2)  
Lodged: 20th February 2020.  
*Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel.*

Carbon Neutral Strategy 2019 (P.127/2019): amendment (P.127/2019 Amd.) – amendment. P.127/2019.  
Amd.Amd.  
Lodged: 14th February 2020.  
*Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier.*

Carbon Neutral Strategy 2019 (P.127/2019): second amendment. P.127/2019.  
Amd.(2)  
Lodged: 7th February 2020.  
*Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel.*

Ban on the sale of plastic bags. P.11/2020.  
(re-issue)  
Lodged: 12th February 2020.  
*Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier.*

Draft Amendment (No. 44) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey. P.12/2020.  
Lodged: 14th February 2020.  
*Scrutiny Liaison Committee.*

Draft Amendment (No. 45) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey. P.13/2020.  
Lodged: 14th February 2020.  
*Scrutiny Liaison Committee.*

The Communications (Jersey) Order 2020: extension to Jersey by Order in Council. P.14/2020.  
Lodged: 19th February 2020.  
*Chief Minister.*

Social Security Medical Appeal Tribunal: re-appointment of medical practitioner members. P.15/2020.  
Lodged: 25th February 2020.  
*Minister for Social Security.*

Income Support Medical Appeal Tribunal: appointment of lay member and re- P.16/2020.  
 appointment of medical practitioner member.  
 Lodged: 25th February 2020.  
*Minister for Social Security.*

Social Security Tribunal: appointment of panel member. P.17/2020.  
 Lodged: 25th February 2020.  
*Minister for Social Security.*

### Written Questions

(see *Official Report/Hansard*)

- WQ.63/2020 1. The Chair of the States Employment Board tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour regarding the resourcing of the Jersey Appointments Commission.
- WQ.64/2020 2. The Chair of the States Employment Board tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour regarding the recording of conflicts of interest during recruitment processes within the States of Jersey.
- WQ.65/2020 3. The Chair of the States Employment Board tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour regarding the involvement of outgoing States of Jersey post-holders in the recruitment of their successor.
- WQ.66/2020 4. The Chair of the States Employment Board tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour regarding the diversity of candidates for senior posts in the States of Jersey.
- WQ.67/2020 5. The Minister for Treasury and Resources tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour regarding the application of States Employment Board processes to States wholly-owned bodies.
- WQ.68/2020 6. The Minister for Infrastructure tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the Number 5 bus route.
- WQ.69/2020 7. The Minister for Infrastructure tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding cycle routes from Town to the north of Jersey.
- WQ.70/2020 8. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding homecare services delivered by Family Nursing and Home Care.
- WQ.71/2020 9. H.M. Attorney General tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the prosecution of parents as a result of their child's absence from school.
- WQ.72/2020 10. The Minister for Education tabled an answer to a question asked by the Deputy of St. John regarding the exclusion of students from the Island's schools.
- WQ.73/2020 11. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.J. Truscott of St. Brelade regarding the Island's preparedness for a positive diagnosis of Coronavirus.
- WQ.74/2020 12. The Minister for Education tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding the development of a youth facility in the north of St. Helier.
- WQ.76/2020 13. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding the categorisation of the new Hospital.

- WQ.77/2020** 14. The Minister for the Environment tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding the protection of mature trees.
- WQ.78/2020** 15. The Chief Minister tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding the levels of confidence in government in Jersey.
- WQ.79/2020** 16. H.M. Attorney General tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding the policies in place in the Law Officers' Department in respect of bullying and whistleblowing.
- WQ.80/2020** 17. The Minister for Education tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding mental health support and education provided in the Island's schools.
- WQ.81/2020** 18. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding the number of families considered to be living in sub-standard accommodation.
- WQ.82/2020** 19. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding the number of families in social housing or on the Affordable Housing Gateway who were living in accommodation with an insufficient number of bedrooms.
- WQ.83/2020** 20. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour regarding the improvement of mental health services in the Island.
- WQ.84/2020** 21. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding the digital transformation required to deliver the Jersey Care Model.
- WQ.85/2020** 22. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding the assumptions underpinning the development of a scheme for affordable primary health care.
- WQ.86/2020** 23. The Minister for Health and Social Services tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding the intention to 'double run' the Health Insurance Fund in order to pay for primary care transformation.
- WQ.87/2020** 24. The Minister for Social Security tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier regarding measures to attract more family members to become carers.
- WQ.88/2020** 25. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy S.M. Ahier of St. Helier regarding the adherence of the Ann Court development to the Disability Strategy.
- WQ.89/2020** 26. The Chair of the States Employment Board tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy C.S. Alves of St. Helier regarding the number of public sector staff accessing the AXA support service.
- WQ.90/2020** 27. The Chair of the States Employment Board tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy C.S. Alves of St. Helier regarding exit interviews undertaken by managers in the States of Jersey.
- WQ.91/2020** 28. The Chair of the States Employment Board tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy C.S. Alves of St. Helier regarding the payment of the Living Wage by contractors engaged by the Government of Jersey.

- WQ.92/2020 29. The Minister for Infrastructure tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy C.S. Alves of St. Helier regarding the decision to allow a public cycle path on property alongside Le Rocquier School field.
- WQ.93/2020 30. The Minister for Education tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy C.S. Alves of St. Helier regarding school Governing Bodies.
- WQ.94/2020 31. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier regarding compliance in his portfolio with the Data Protection (Jersey) Law 2018.
- WQ.95/2020 32. The Minister for the Environment tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier regarding compliance in his portfolio with the Data Protection (Jersey) Law 2018.
- WQ.96/2020 33. The Minister for Children and Housing tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier regarding the measures in place to ensure that officers supporting his portfolio acted with honesty.
- WQ.97/2020 34. The Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee tabled an answer to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding compulsory voter registration.

### Oral Questions

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

- OQ.27/2020 1. Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier asked a question of H.M. Solicitor General regarding the compliance of the Law Officers' Department with the Data Protection (Jersey) Law 2018.
- OQ.62/2020 2. Deputy S.M. Ahier of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Children and Housing regarding the decision to introduce payments of £40,000 a year to foster parents of children with complex needs.
- OQ.52/2020 3. Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the Assisted Dying Citizens' Jury.
- OQ.50/2020 4. Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the impact on Jersey's immigration system of any new migration controls introduced in the United Kingdom.
- OQ.49/2020 5. Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Children and Housing regarding the allocation of emergency housing to victims of domestic abuse.
- OQ.51/2020 6. The Connétable of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Infrastructure regarding the taxi industry in Jersey.
- OQ.48/2020 7. Deputy J.M. Maçon of St. Saviour asked a question of the Vice-Chair of the States Employment Board regarding the number of local candidates in States of Jersey recruitment processes.
- OQ.60/2020 8. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for External Relations regarding the impact of Brexit on the Island's finance industry.
- OQ.55/2020 9. Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier asked a question of the Vice-Chair of the States Employment Board regarding interaction with the unions in respect of the new employee relations framework.

- OQ.58/2020** 10. Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier asked a question of H.M. Solicitor General regarding conflicts of interest arising from the Law Officers' role as legal advisors to the Government of Jersey and the support they offered to 'backbenchers'.
- OQ.53/2020** 11. Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour asked a question of the Assistant Minister for Social Security regarding the Disability Strategy Annual Progress Report.
- OQ.61/2020** 12. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding the affordability of wound dressings for those in receipt of a Long-Term Care award and in a residential care home.
- OQ.59/2020** 13. Deputy M.R. Higgins of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding evidence-gathering by the States of Jersey Police from underage victims of alleged grooming by an adult.
- OQ.56/2020** 14. Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier asked a question of the Assistant Minister for Social Security regarding the repayment terms for historic overpayments of Income Support.

### **Oral Questions without notice**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Minister for Health and Social Services answered questions without notice from members.

In the absence of the Chief Minister, the Deputy Chief Minister answered questions without notice from members.

### **Statements on a matter of official responsibility**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Chair of the Government Plan Efficiencies Review Panel made a statement regarding the commencement of the Review Panel's work.

### **Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES, adopting the request of the Chair of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel, agreed in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), to reduce the minimum lodging period in respect of the amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.106/2019 Amd.(2)) to the Draft Public Health and Safety (Rented Dwellings) (Licensing) (Jersey) Regulations 201-, in order that it might be debated at the present meeting.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 33**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John

#### **CONTRE: 7**

Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**



Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

### **Draft Public Health and Safety (Rented Dwellings) (Licensing) (Jersey) Regulations 201- P.106/2019**

THE STATES commenced consideration of the Draft Public Health and Safety (Rented Dwellings) (Licensing) (Jersey) Regulations 201-.

THE STATES adopted a proposition of the Deputy of St. Peter that, in accordance with Standing Order 83(1)(a), the matter should be referred back to the Minister for the Environment in order that further information relating to the proposition could be provided to the Assembly.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 24**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)

#### **CONTRE: 18**

Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)

#### **ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy of St. Mary	Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)	Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)	
Deputy K.F. Morel (L)	
Deputy of St. Peter	
Deputy of Trinity	
Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)	
Deputy I. Gardiner (H)	

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(1)(b), the following members declared an interest, but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate on the Draft Public Health and Safety (Rented Dwellings) (Licensing) (Jersey) Regulations 201- (P.106/2019) –

Senator Ian Joseph Gorst  
 Senator Lyndon John Farnham  
 Senator Kristina Louise Moore  
 The Connétable of St. Helier  
 The Connétable of Grouville  
 The Connétable of St. John  
 The Connétable of St. Mary  
 The Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade  
 Deputy Susan Jane Pinel of St. Clement  
 The Deputy of St. Martin  
 The Deputy of St. Ouen  
 The Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade  
 Deputy Kirsten Francis Morel of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy Gregory Charles Umberto Guida of St. Lawrence  
 The Deputy of St. Peter  
 The Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy Inna Gardiner of St. Helier

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(1)(c), Senator Samuel Yves Mézec and Deputy Lindsay Barry Edward Ash of St. Clement declared an interest which was not financial and remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate on the Draft Public Health and Safety (Rented Dwellings) (Licensing) (Jersey) Regulations 201-.

### **Changes in Presidency**

The Deputy Bailiff retired from the Chair during consideration of the Draft Public Health and Safety (Rented Dwellings) (Licensing) (Jersey) Regulations 201- and the meeting resumed following the lunch adjournment under the Presidency of the Bailiff.

### **Carbon Neutral Strategy 2019 P.127/2019**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Minister for the Environment entitled ‘Carbon Neutral Strategy 2019’ (P.127/2019) and, commencing consideration of an amendment of Deputy Kirsten Francis Morel of St. Lawrence (P.127/2019 Amd.), adopted an amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.127/2019 Amd.Amd.) that, for the words to be inserted in paragraph (a), after the words “do not” there should be inserted the word “overall” and for the word “financial” there should be substituted the word “income”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 36**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES, adopting the amendment of Deputy Kirsten Francis Morel of St. Lawrence (P.127/2019 Amd.), as amended, agreed that, at the end of paragraph (a), after the word “Report” there should be inserted the words “with the addition of a fifth defining principle, “We will make sure that carbon neutrality policies do not overall increase income inequality”, in accordance with the more detailed explanation of the principle set out in the report accompanying this amendment”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 36**

**CONTRE: 0**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Minister for the Environment, as amended, and, adopting Part 1 of an amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.127/2019 Amd.(2)), agreed that, in paragraph (b), after the words “Appendix to the Report”, there should be inserted the words “except that, for the first bullet point of Paragraph iii, there shall be substituted the following bullet point –

- “• a chairperson to be appointed by the Government with the consent of the citizen’s assembly; and” ”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 22**

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen

**CONTRE: 16**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy R. Labey (H)	Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
Deputy of St. Mary	Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)	Deputy of St. John
Deputy K.F. Morel (L)	Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
Deputy of St. Peter	Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
Deputy of Trinity	
Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)	
Deputy R.J. Ward (H)	
Deputy C.S. Alves (H)	
Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)	
Deputy I. Gardiner (H)	

THE STATES, adopting Part 2 of the amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.127/2019 Amd.(2)), agreed that, in paragraph (b), after the words, “the Appendix to the Report”, there should be inserted the words “except that, after Paragraph viii, the following paragraph shall be inserted –

“(ix) The Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel shall have the right to observe meetings of the citizens’ assembly, as well as the selection and reporting process, and will report its observations and findings to the States Assembly.” ”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 31**

Senator I.J. Gorst  
 Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

**CONTRE: 8**

Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 26th February 2020 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Minister for the Environment entitled ‘Carbon Neutral Strategy 2019’ (P.127/2019), as amended, and other outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.30 p.m.

**L.-M. HART**

*Deputy Greffier of the States*